

# Multi-stakeholder Processes for Governance and Sustainability

*This book is dedicated to*

*WARREN 'CHIP' LINDNER  
(1942-2000)*

*A dear friend and mentor, who contributed so much to sustainable development and focusing the struggle against HIV/Aids on those in the South*

# Multi-stakeholder Processes for Governance and Sustainability

Beyond Deadlock and Conflict

*Minu Hemmati*

with contributions from

*Felix Dodds, Jasmin Enayati and  
Jan McHarry*

**EARTHSCAN**

Earthscan Publications Ltd  
London • Sterling, VA

First published in the UK and USA in 2002 by  
Earthscan Publications Ltd

Copyright © United Nations Environment and Development - UK Committee  
(UNED-UK Committee) and Minu Hemmati, 2002

**All rights reserved**

ISBN: 1 85383 870 5 paperback  
1 85383 869 1 hardback

Typesetting by JS Typesetting, Wellingborough, Northants  
Printed and bound by Creative Print and Design, Ebbw Vale (Wales)  
Cover design by Danny Gillespie

For a full list of publications please contact:

Earthscan Publications Ltd  
120 Pentonville Road  
London, N1 9JN, UK  
Tel: +44 (0)20 7278 0433  
Fax: +44 (0)20 7278 1142  
Email: [earthinfo@earthscan.co.uk](mailto:earthinfo@earthscan.co.uk)  
<http://www.earthscan.co.uk>

22883 Quicksilver Drive, Sterling, VA 20166-2012, USA

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Hemmati, Minu, 1963-.

Multi-stakeholder processes for governance and sustainability : beyond  
deadlock and conflict / Minu Hemmati ; with contributions from Felix Dodds,  
Jasmin Enyati, and Jan McHarry.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-85383-869-1 (hardback) - ISBN 1-85383-870-5 (pbk.)

1. Sustainable development--Decision making. 2. Sustainable development--  
International cooperation. 3. Sustainable development--Citizen participation.  
4. Intergovernmental cooperation. 5. Public-private sector cooperation. 6.  
Multiple criteria decision making. I. Title.

HC79.E5H456 2002  
658.4'03--dc21

2001007555

Earthscan is an editorially independent subsidiary of Kogan Page Ltd and  
publishes in association with WWF-UK and the International Institute for  
Environment and Development

This book is printed on elemental chlorine-free paper

# Contents

<i>List of Figures, Tables and Boxes</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>About the Authors</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Glossary, Acronyms and Abbreviations</i>	<i>xii</i>
<i>A Call to Readers</i>	<i>xvi</i>
1 Introduction	1
Where We Are	4
One Step Beyond	6
An Eclectic Approach	7
Nothing New?	9
The Book	9
<b>PART I BUILDING-BLOCKS</b>	
2 Terms, Variety and Goals	15
Clarification of Terms	15
A Variety of Processes	20
The Goals	23
3 The Context: Multi-stakeholder Processes and Global Governance <i>by Felix Dodds</i>	26
Impact of UN Reform Packages	29
The Role of the CSD in Evolving Change	31
UNAIDS	34
The Future	34
4 The Concepts: Key Values and Ideologies of MSPs	39
Fundamental Values	40
Derived Concepts and Strategies	52
Partnership, Collaboration and Solidarity	54
5 The Research: Effective Communication and Decision-making in Diverse Groups <i>by Jasmin Enayati</i>	73
Introduction	73
Overview of Findings	74
Conclusions	94

6	The Practice: Examples of Multi-stakeholder Processes	96
	Overview	97
	Reported Problems and Conclusions	115
	Twenty Examples	119

## **PART II How To Do It**

7	Designing MSPs: A Detailed Guide	209
	Some General Considerations	209
	Context	211
	Framing	225
	Inputs	229
	Dialogue/Meetings	235
	Outputs	241
	Throughout the Process	245
8	The Short-cut	249
	Principles of Stakeholder Involvement and Partnership	249
	A Checklist for MSP Designers	251
9	Conclusion: More Than One Step Beyond – What Next?	263
	<i>Appendix I Methodology of the Project</i>	266
	<i>Appendix II Contributors, Commentators and Interviewees</i>	270
	<i>Appendix III UNED Forum</i>	273
	<i>References</i>	274
	<i>Notes</i>	297
	<i>Index</i>	307

## List of Figures, Tables and Boxes

### FIGURES

7.1	Overview	211
7.2	Context	212
7.3	Framing	225
7.4	Inputs	229
7.5	Dialogue/Meetings	236
7.6	Outputs	242
7.7	Throughout the Process	245

### TABLES

3.1	Number of ECOSOC Recognized NGOs Before and After Each Review of Consultative Status	28
-----	--	----

### BOXES

1.1	Stakeholders	2
1.2	Sustainable Development	3
2.1	Terms Used to Describe Multi-stakeholder and Similar Processes	16
4.1	Governance	40
4.2	Democracy	42
4.3	Participation	44
4.4	Commitment	45
4.5	Equity	46
4.6	Justice	47
4.7	Unity	48
4.8	Diversity	48
4.9	Leadership	50
4.10	Partnership and Collaboration	54
4.11	Solidarity	54

4.12	Transparency	56
4.13	The Rio Declaration, 1992: Principle 10	57
4.14	Inclusive	59
4.15	Legitimacy	60
4.16	Accountability	62
4.17	Measuring Accountability and Transparency	63
4.18	Responsibility	64
4.19	Communication	65
4.20	Consensus-building?	69
4.21	'Parting the Waters' in the Debate over Dams	71



## About the Authors

### **Felix Dodds**

UNED Forum Executive Director, developing and managing projects for UNED, Felix represents UNED at UN events and helps to organize and facilitate the involvement of Major Groups in the UN system both domestically and internationally. He co-chaired the CSD NGO Steering Committee from 1997 to 2001 which coordinated the involvement of NGOs in the UN Commission on Sustainable Development. He has been NGO adviser to the UK Government at the UN Commission on Sustainable Development (1993–1996) and the European Commission (1997–1998). He has attended the UN Rio Summit, Habitat II, Earth Summit II, Beijing+5 and Copenhagen+5. He has published three books: *Into the Twenty-first Century: An Agenda for Political Realignment* (edited, 1988), *The Way Forward: Beyond Agenda 21* (edited, 1997) and *Earth Summit 2002: A New Deal* (edited, revised edition, 2001). Felix co-ordinated UNED's project on MSPs with Minu Hemmati and has written Chapter 4 of this book, putting MSPs in the context of the debate on global governance.

### **Jasmin Enayati**

Jasmin holds an MSc in Social and Organizational Psychology from the London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE). She has been working as an independent consultant with UNED Forum on various projects since January 2000, such as the website on social development and Copenhagen+5 and the conference on 'Gender Perspectives for Earth Summit 2002'. Jasmin also edits UNED Forum's Newsletter *Connections*. She has contributed to the work on UNED Forum's project on MSPs as a project assistant and has produced the review of relevant scientific research (see Chapter 6).

### **Dr Minu Hemmati**

A psychologist by profession, Minu's doctorate is in environmental and organizational psychology. She worked in research and teaching at the Department for Social Psychology and Women's Studies at the University of Saarbrücken, Germany, from 1992 to 1998. She has been working with UNED Forum as an independent project coordinator since 1998. Her projects focus on areas such as women/gender and sustainable development (tourism and consumption) as well as the participation and collaboration of various stakeholder groups. She has represented the Bahá'í International Community at the Habitat II Conference (Istanbul, 1996) and the Commission on Sustainable Development (CSD) meetings in 1997, as well as Earth Summit II and UNED Forum at all CSD meetings since 1998, and at Copenhagen+5 and Beijing+5. Minu co-coordinated the Women's Caucus to the UN Commission on Sustainable Development from 1999 to 2001. She co-coordinated UNED's project on MSPs with Felix Dodds.

### **Jan McHarry**

Jan holds an MSc in Environmental Resource Planning, and is an independent writer and researcher specializing in sustainable development, waste and recycling issues. She works with national organizations and community groups and was involved in early work on Local Agenda 21 programmes and sustainability indicators for use at the community level. As a recycling specialist, Jan has been instrumental in the development of 'Buy Recycled' initiatives within the UK. She writes for a wide range of audiences, has over 25 years' practical involvement in environmental campaigning, including working as Information Officer for Friends of the Earth UK. She is a practising Buddhist with a particular interest in exploring the links between Buddhist ethics and environmental-social action. Jan has undertaken the major part of the research on the example processes studied for this publication.

## Acknowledgements

This book has significantly benefited from many people's input. They helped us with their knowledge and ideas. They pointed us to useful references. They challenged our suggestions and argued the opposite, making us reconsider and differentiate. They took the time to be interviewed or fill in our questionnaire on MSP examples. They looked through draft documents and commented, providing guidance, question marks and amendments. This included many members of UNED Forum's International Advisory Board and Executive Committee, and many of those who have been involved in the example processes (see Appendix II). The work was also greatly helped by the 90 participants at a weekend workshop we held in New York in April 2001 where lively dialogues helped to sharpen our ideas.

Among all of them, one person was extremely helpful: Paul Hohnen, former Director of Greenpeace International and adviser to a range of international NGOs, organizations and corporations. He reviewed an earlier version of the text and provided a large number of invaluable contributions, comments, amendments and questions.

The book would by no means be the same without Paul and all the others. However, the authors take full responsibility for the contents of the book, including its shortcomings.

Second, our thanks go to those who supported UNED Forum's project on MSPs which led to this book: Novartis (Switzerland) provided the larger part of the financial resources and in-kind support by assigning Malou Lesquite to work with us on the project and the preparations for the workshop in New York. The Ford Foundation provided additional financial resources and supported a number of participants from developing countries in attending the workshop. BP Amoco plc hosted us at their conference facilities in New York, providing an environment which added to the enthusiasm and productivity of the event.

*Minu Hemmati, Felix Dodds, Jasmin Enayati and Jan McHarry*

## Glossary, Acronyms and Abbreviations

ACCA	Association of Chartered Certified Accountants
APNCSD	Asia-Pacific National Councils for Sustainable Development
Bureau	Bureaus of UN Commissions or Secretariats are composed of a chair or two co-chairs and representatives of the five regional groupings of member states
BSAP	Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan
CBD	Convention on Biological Diversity
CDW	Country Dialogue Workshop
CERES	Coalition for Environmentally Responsible Economies
CIEH	Chartered Institute of Environmental Health Officers
COP	Conference of Parties
CSD	UN Commission on Sustainable Development
CSD Intersessional	The official 22 sessions between meetings of the CSD
DAC	Development Assistance Committee
DAW	UN Division for the Advancement of Women
DESA	<i>see UNDESA</i>
DFID	UK Department for International Development
DPI	UN Department of Public Information
DSD	UN Division for Sustainable Development
DSTI	Directorate for Science, Technology and Industry
ECOSOC	UN Economic and Social Council
EEHC	European Environment and Health Committee
EU	European Union
FAO	UN Food and Agriculture Organization
FfD	Financing for Development (international conference 2002)
FLG	Forum Liaison Group
FSC	Forest Stewardship Council

G-77/China	The Group of 77 and China was the original group of the so-called non-aligned states. It is in effect the negotiating bloc of the developing countries and seeks to harmonize the negotiating positions of its over 140 members.
GA	UN General Assembly
GC	Global Compact
GEF	Global Environment Facility
GMI	Global Mining Initiative
GMO	genetically modified organism
GNP	gross national product
GPP	Global Public Policy
GRI	Global Reporting Initiative
HCHR	High Commission for Human Rights
High level segment	The ministerial-level part of the CSD meetings where most significant issues are decided
HIPC	Heavily Indebted Poor Countries
ICC	International Chamber of Commerce
ICFTU	International Confederation of Free Trade Unions
ICLEI	International Council of Local Environmental Initiatives
IFEH	International Federation of Environmental Health
IIED	International Institute for Environment and Development
ILO	International Labour Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INSTRAW	International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
ISO	International Organization for Standardization
IUCN	International Union for the Conservation of Nature (now known as The World Conservation Union)
IULA	International Union of Local Authorities
LA21	Local Agenda 21
LASALA	Local Authorities Self-Assessment of Local Agenda 21
Major Groups	The term used in Agenda 21 to describe nine sectors of society fundamental to achieving sustainable development. The Major Groups are: Women, Children and Youth, Indigenous Peoples, Non-governmental Organizations, Local

	Authorities, Workers and Trade Unions, Business and Industry, Scientific and Technological Communities, and Farmers
MAP	Mediterranean Action Plan
MCSD	Mediterranean Commission on Sustainable Development
Member State	A nation that is a member of the UN
MISP	Multi-stakeholder Integrative Sustainability Planning
MMSD	Mining, Minerals and Sustainable Development
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MSC	Marine Stewardship Council
MSD	multi-stakeholder dialogue
MSP	multi-stakeholder process
NCSD	National Councils for Sustainable Development
NEPA	National Environmental Policy Act (US)
NGLS	Non-governmental Liaison Service
NGO	non-governmental organization
NGT	nominal group technique
NIS	Newly Independent States
NOAA	National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (US)
North	The current widely used term to describe developed, industrialized countries
NSSD	National Strategies for Sustainable Development
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OFP	Operational Focal Point
PA21	Philippine Agenda 21
PCB	programme coordinating board
PCSD	Philippine Council for Sustainable Development
PfA	Platform for Action
Plenary	A meeting of all participants where formal decisions are taken
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
RC	Regional Coordinator
REC	Regional Environment Centre for Central and Eastern Europe
SAFS	Sustainable Agriculture and Food Systems
SC	Steering Committee
South	The current widely-used term to describe developing, non-industrialized countries
STAP	Scientific and Advisory Panel (Global Environment Facility)
TNC	transnational corporation

TOR	Terms of Reference
UKCAP	UK Coalition Against Poverty
UNAIDS	United Nations HIV/AIDS Programme (coordinating the activities of seven international agencies in the area of HIV/AIDS, including WHO, UNDP, UNESCO, UNFPA, UNDCP and the World Bank)
UNA-UK	United Nations Association, UK
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNCHS	United Nations Centre for Human Settlements
UNDCP	United Nations International Drug Control Programme
UNDESA	United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNSD	United Nations Division for Sustainable Development
UNECE	United Nations Economic Commission for Europe
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNGASS	United Nations General Assembly Special Session
UNICEF	United Nations (International) Children's (Emergency) Fund
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UNU	United Nations University
WB	World Bank
WBCSD	World Business Council for Sustainable Development
WCD	World Commission on Dams
WEDO	Women's Environment and Development Organization
WEF	World Economic Forum
WFUNA	World Federation of United Nations Associates
WHO	World Health Organization
WIPO	World Intellectual Property Organization
WTO	World Trade Organization
WWF	World Wide Fund For Nature

## A Call to Readers

Sustainable development is a process, and multi-stakeholder processes are one of the tools that can help us to achieve a more sustainable future. Increasing the utility of MSPs requires that we understand and evaluate how they have been used in the past, that we gain more experiences in more such processes, that we experiment with them:

*Since the answers to fundamental and serious concerns are not at hand, there is no alternative but to keep on trying to find them.* (Brundtland, 1987, p ix)

We very much want our readers to join us in this learning process. Please contact us at UNED Forum, c/o UNA-UK, 3 Whitehall Court, London SW1A 2EL, UK.

Regular updates on UNED Forum's work on MSPs can be found at: [www.earthsummit2002.org/msp](http://www.earthsummit2002.org/msp).